

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contributors	XV
Abberviations	XVII
INTRODUCTION (R. Szczepaniak, M. Krzymuski)	1
PART I	
MAIN METHODOLOGICAL AND THEORETICAL PROBLEMS RELATED TO THE APPLICATION OF PRIVATE LAW IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR (R. Szczepaniak)	
	19
Chapter 1. Linguistic determinants of research on the application of private law in the public sector	
	21
I. Introduction	21
II. Classification of languages within the field in question	24
III. Problems of comparative nature	25
IV. Lack of conceptual precision in research on the application of private (civil) law in the public sector	29
1. Problem with concepts in which the adjective “public” appears	29
2. The problem of internal stratification of the tort liability of public authorities	32
3. The attribute of “public law”	35
V. An attempt to systematize concepts	36
1. Initial assumptions	36
2. “Public sector,” “public entity,” “public administration”	36
3. Occam’s razor method	41
1) “Entity of public law” (“legal person under public law”)	41
2) The concept of “Fiskus” (in the Polish language of civil law “Skarb Państwa”) as the state operating in the area of private law	45
3) The division into public and private law	48
4) The non-dichotomous nature of division into public and private law	54
5) Breaking with the division into actes d’autorité (acts of authority, imperium) and actes de gestion (corporate acts, dominium)	57
VI. Risk of manipulation through interference in the semantic rules of the language of legal acts and legal language	58
VII. Conclusions	60

Chapter 2. Division into public law and private law in the context of constitutional axiology	62
I. Introduction	62
II. Ideological and constitutional dimension of the division	63
III. Other reasons for cultivating this division	69
IV. Autonomy of individual branches of law	71
V. Factors weakening the division into public and private law	73
1. Challenging the methodological correctness of this division	73
2. Criticism of ideological (political) approach	76
VI. EU law	77
VII. Polish version of the division into public and private law	85
1. Introductory remarks	85
2. The principle of unity of civil law in Polish conditions	87
3. Difficult transition from the previous legal system	93
VIII. Criteria for distinguishing between private and public law or (Germ. "oder") criteria justifying cases of derogation from general law (civil law)	98
1. Introductory remarks	98
2. The subjective criterion versus the criterion of interest	101
3. The subjective criterion versus the criterion of subordination	102
4. Public entities using private entities in performing their tasks	105
IX. Conclusions	107
Chapter 3. Private law and the Constitution	110
I. The essence of constitutionalization of private law	110
II. The evolution of the constitutional process on the example of Germany and Poland	112
1. Germany	112
2. Poland	117
III. Means of influence of the Constitution on private law	122
1. Introduction	122
2. Interpretation of law	122
3. Inferential rules	129
4. General Clauses	129
IV. The place of civil law principles in the hierarchical legal system	133
V. Competition of constitutional principles	137
PART II	
PROBLEMS OF CIVIL LAW FORMS OF ADMINISTRATION ACTIVITY FROM THE POINT OF VIEW OF A REPRESENTATIVE OF THE SCIENCE OF PUBLIC LAW (K. Kokocińska)	141
Chapter I. The sense and significance of the separation of public law and private law in the light of public law sciences	143
I. Relations between public law and private law	143
II. Separation of regimes at the level of legal institutions	151

Chapter 2. On the penetration and interaction of law	153
I. Auxiliary application of private law provisions	153
II. Problems of borderline areas in law	156
Chapter 3. Private law in administration activities	162
I. The concept of shaping of legal relations on two levels as a consequence of using different forms of action in terms of their legal nature	162
II. Administrative private law (Verwaltungsprivatrecht)	166
Chapter 4. Issues of consensual forms in the activities of public administration	170
I. Determinants of changes within the catalog of legal forms of public admin- istration activities	170
II. Organizational freedom in the provision of public services	177
III. Bilateral forms of activity in contemporary public administration	184
IV. Bilateral forms of activity in the classification of legal forms of public ad- ministration, with particular emphasis on the contract	189
V. Civil law contract concluded by the administration	193
VI. Administrative agreement	195
VII. Atypical consensual activities in the light of typologies of bilateral forms of activity (the contract in relations between executive entities)	198

PART III

SELECTED EXAMPLES OF THE APPLICATION OF CIVIL LAW INSTITUTIONS IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR (R. Szczepaniak, M. Krzymuski)	205
---	-----

Chapter 1. The freedom of contract in the public sector, with particular em- phasis on Polish and German experience	207
I. Introduction	207
II. Terminological and classification problems	210
III. Constitutional principles and values in the light of the freedom of contract for public entities	214
1. New Public Management	214
2. The Fiskus theory	215
3. The fundamental rights seen as the limits of freedom of contract. The issue of the constitutional subjectivity of public entities	218
4. The principle of a democratic state	222
5. The principle of the state ruled by law	223
1) The requirement of a legal basis – the principle of statutory reserva- tion in German law	223
a) Public law contracts	223
b) Civil law contracts	230
2) The requirement of a legal basis in Polish law	233
3) Article 353 ¹ of the Polish Civil Code as the legal basis for concluding contracts by public sector entities	239

IV. More about the controversy around the understanding of the concept of “freedom of contract”	240
V. The freedom of contract in the activities of local self-government	246
VI. The freedom of contract in the context of special legal capacity (ultra vires) of public entities as well as the scope and nature of their subjective rights	252
VII. Legal consequences of crossing the limits of the freedom of contract in the public sector	257
VIII. Conclusions	260

Chapter 2. Application of civil law provisions to liability for damages of public authorities in the light of constitutional principles

I. The regime of tort liability of public authorities and classic civil law	267
II. The escape of the regime of liability for damages of public authorities from the framework of the traditional science of civil law	273
III. Stratification of the liability of public authorities in Poland as a manifestation of the escape of the liability regime of public authorities from the framework of traditional science of civil law	275
IV. Public authorities’ liability for legal acts in Poland	281
V. Civil law liability for damages and the specificity of the State on the example of Polish law	284
VI. Unsuitability of art. 429 of Polish the Civil Code for the specificity of the public sector	287
VII. Conclusions regarding Polish law	289
VIII. Application of civil law provisions to liability for damages of public authorities (remarks on the situation in German law)	291
1. The system of the liability of public authorities in German law	291
2. The principle of federalism and legislative competences – a legislative episode in the 1980s	292
3. Stratification of legal instruments of State liability	295
4. The nature of State liability	296
5. Amtshaftung	297
6. Liability of the State as a participant in civil law transactions	301
7. State liability for legislative acts	302
8. The issue of contractual liability	304
9. Liability of the State for legal actions	306
10. Conclusions regarding German law	308
IX. Some reflections on comparative law research in the area of the tort liability of public authorities and on the process of convergence of compensation regimes of public authorities in Europe	308
X. Convergence as a result of EU membership	311
XI. General conclusions from the presentation of the Polish and German regime of the tort liability of public authorities	314

Chapter 3. Subjective rights in the public sector (Selected issues)	321
I. Introduction. The achievements of civil law in shaping the concept of the subjective right	321
II. Polish Law	322
1. Introductory remarks	322
2. Characteristics of the property belonging to public entities	323
3. The nature of public property in the light of the Constitution	327
4. Internal roads and public roads	331
5. Constitutional conflicts related to public property	332
6. The scope of powers resulting from property rights enjoyed by public entities and the scope of their legal capacity	334
7. The case of open pension funds	336
8. The issue of fundamental (constitutional) rights of public entities	339
III. German law	340
1. Introduction	340
2. The concept of property and public property	341
3. The concept of public things (öffentliche Sachen)	342
4. Public property law on movable property?	343
5. Public ownership	344
6. Civil law property of public entities and its limitations	349
IV. Conclusions from the presentation of Polish and German law	351
Chapter 4. The legal institution of unjust enrichment in the public sector (Selected issues)	353
I. Introduction	353
II. Polish law	354
1. Legal qualification of the basic relationship in the context of unjust enrichment	354
2. Autonomy of tax law versus unjust enrichment	356
1) General remarks	356
2) The position of the highest courts in Poland	357
3. Unjust enrichment in the social insurance law	363
4. Conclusions	364
III. German Law	366
1. Introductory remarks	366
2. Reimbursement claims based on special regulations	367
1) Introduction	367
2) Reimbursement claims in German tax law (§ 37 section 2 AO)	368
3) Reimbursement claim in the case of withdrawal of an administrative decision (§ 49a (1) of the Administrative Procedure Act (VwVfG)) ..	369
4) Claims for unduly paid social benefits (§ 50 (1) and (2) of the Social Insurance Code Vol. 10 (SGB X))	370

3. General public law reimbursement claims	371
1) General information	371
2) Premises for general reimbursement claims	372
a) General information	372
b) Material benefit (Vermögensverschiebung)	373
c) Public law relationship between parties (öffentlich-rechtliche Rechtsbeziehung)	373
d) Lack of legal basis for property benefits effected	375
e) Scope of claim	376
f) Return of unjust benefit	376
g) Disposal of the enrichment	376
h) Compensation of mutual reimbursement claims	378
IV. General Conclusions regarding Polish and German Law	378

Chapter 5. Application of the provisions of the Civil Code concerning declarations of intent in the public sector

I. Polish law	379
1. Introduction	379
2. The concept of declarations of intent and legal action (<i>das Rechtsgeschäft</i>) in administrative law	381
3. Arguments against the application of the Civil Code to declarations of intent in the public sector	383
4. Arguments for applying the Civil Code to declarations of intent in the public sector	384
1) Similarity criterion	384
2) Pragmatic reasons	390
3) Civil law as technical law	392
5. Specific issues	393
1) Administrative power of attorney	393
2) Revocation of declarations of intent made by parties to administrative proceedings	397
3) Interpretation of declarations of intent by parties in administrative proceedings	403
4) Document delivery	409
5) Defects of declarations of intent made by parties in administrative proceedings	411
II. German law	416
1. The concept of the declaration of intent and legal act (<i>das Rechtsgeschäft</i>) in German public law	416
2. Arguments for applying civil law provisions to public law declarations of intent	417
1) General remarks	417

2) Specific issues	418
a) Interpretation of declarations of intent in civil law	418
b) Application of the provisions of § 133 and § 157 BGB to the interpretation of declarations in administrative law	421
c) Avoidance of the effects of a declaration of intent (Anfechtung) ..	425
d) Set-off in administrative law	427
e) Conclusion of a public law contract	427
f) § 59 VwVfG in the context of § 134 BGB, that is the issue of invalidity of a public law contract	428
g) Representation	430
h) Declarations of intent reaching the addressee	430
III. Conclusions regarding Polish and German law	431
Chapter 6. Set-off in public sector	435
I. General considerations	435
II. Poland	436
1. Introduction	436
2. Analysis of selected cases of set-off in the public sector	436
1) Set-off of tax liabilities	436
2) Set-off of public funds constituting non-tax budgetary receivables of public-law nature	438
3) Set-off based on the Act on Social Assistance	439
4) Set-off on the basis of the Act of 9 May 2008 on the Agency for Restructuring and Modernization of Agriculture	440
5) Set-off on the basis of the Act on the principles of management of state property	442
3. Differences between set-off under the Civil Code and in the public sector	443
4. Possibility of applying the provisions of the Polish Civil Code regarding set-off in the public sector. Conclusions	445
III. Germany	447
1. Preliminary considerations	447
2. Public law set-off sensu stricto	450
1) Preliminary remarks	450
2) Set-off in tax law (§ 226 AO)	450
3) Set-off in social affairs (§ 51 SGB I – Sozialgesetzbuch)	452
4) Other provisions	454
3. Set-off based on general principles	454
1) Introduction	454
2) Legal basis for set-off	455
3) Admissibility of set-off	455
4) Mutual and homogeneous claims	456

5) Maturity and enforceability of claims	457
6) Declaration of set-off	458
7) Consequences of set-off	460
IV. General conclusions regarding Polish and German law	460
Chapter 7. Charging of interest for delayed payment in the public sector (Selected Issues)	462
I. Polish Law	462
1. Introduction	462
2. Charging interest in the event of a delay in the payment of the awarded trial costs	462
1) Introductory remarks	462
2) Arguments for and against interest on costs of legal proceedings not paid in due time	464
3. Charging of interest for delayed payment as the guiding principle of the entire legal system	466
4. Interest in tax law and public finance law	467
5. Conclusions	468
II. German law	472
1. Principles regarding the interest rate on cash liabilities resulting from public-law titles	472
1) Introductory remarks	472
2) The legal basis for charging interest	473
a) § 49a (3) sentence 1 VwVfG	473
b) Other provisions	475
2. Application of civil law provisions	476
1) Introductory remarks	476
2) Late payment interest (§ 286 BGB in conjunction with § 288 BGB) .	476
3) Interest on litigation costs (§ 291 BGB)	479
4) § 818 (1) BGB	480
5) § 849 BGB	481
6) § 839 BzGB in conjunction with art. 34 GG	481
3. Limitation of claims for payment of interest	481
4. Court proceedings	482
III. General conclusions resulting from the analysis of German and Polish law	483
Chapter 8. The application of Actio Pauliana to tax obligations	485
I. Introduction	485
II. Polish law	485
1. Evolution of views	485
2. The autonomy of tax law and the division of the legal system into public law and private law	488
3. A reference to French solutions	489

4. The issue of prohibiting the use of civil law by analogy to the detriment of citizens	490
5. The issue of the method of applying civil law provisions: directly or by analogy	491
6. Other arguments against the application of Actio Pauliana to tax liabilities and polemics with them	494
III. Actio Pauliana in German tax law	496
1. Sources of law	496
2. Legal basis for the use of AnfG in the enforcement of tax liabilities	498
3. The situation before the introduction of § 191 subsection 1 sent. 2 AO	499
4. Constitutional doubts	503
1) Introductory remarks	503
2) Violation of art. 101 section 1 sent. 2 of GG	503
3) Violation of the principle of equality	504
4) Violation of art. 20 section 3 GG	505
5. Amendment of § 191 subsection 1 AO and its effects	506
6. Rules for issuing a decision ordering a third party to tolerate executions (Duldungsbescheid). Premises for issuing an administrative decision	507
7. Direct effects	508
8. Systemic effects	508
9. Conditions for raising an allegation (para. 9 of the AnfG)	509
10. The admissibility of filing of an action under §§ 11, 13 AnfG by the tax authorities	509
IV. General conclusions resulting from the analysis of German and Polish law	510

Chapter 9. Methodology for applying private law in the public sector (summary of Part III)	512
I. Introduction. A reference to French solutions	512
II. German methodology for applying private law in the public sector (with reference to Polish science)	518
1. Analogy and reasoning through the prism of the main principles of law	518
2. The concept of administrative private law (Verwaltungsprivatrecht) and the theory of two stages	532
III. Methodology of applying private law in the public sector against the background of the concept of sources of law	535
IV. The issue of the civil law provenience of the main principles of the legal system	545
V. Direct application of civil law provisions in the public sector	557
1. Introduction	557
2. Relationships under civil law	558
1) General reflections	558

2) Civil law relationship in Polish legal science	558
3) Civil law relationship in German legal sciences	565
VI. Conclusion	567
 PART IV	
THE CURRENT STATE OF CIVIL LAW METHODOLOGY FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF ANALYSES OF THE APPLICATION OF PRIVATE LAW IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR (R. Szczepaniak)	573
 Chapter 1. The effectiveness of civil law methodology and the specifics of the public sector	
	575
 Chapter 2. From the Fiscus Theory to the concept of horizontal effect of fundamental rights	
	583
 Chapter 3. Between the technical and axiological dimension of civil law	
I. Introductory remarks	590
II. Technical and axiological component in civil law institutions	591
III. Civil law and praxeology rules	598
IV. Civil law as primary law	598
V. Reception capacity of civil law	599
VI. Balancing between values	601
VII. The technical nature of civil law institutions and the method of their application in the public sector	603
 Chapter 4. Civil law axiology versus the Constitution (conclusions)	
	605
 Chapter 5. The sense of distinguishing the civil law of the public sector as one of the civil (private) law sub-branches	
	611
 LIST OF THE MOST IMPORTANT CONCLUSIONS (R. Szczepaniak)	
	623
 Bibliography	
	649